

Overview of CJEU



judgments and
pending cases

Overview of judgments and pending cases of the Court of Justice of the European Union on:

- 1. Regular Migration
- 2. Asylum
- 3. Borders and Visa
- 4. Irregular Migration
- 5. EEC-Turkey Association Agreement
- 6. Free Movement

December 2019
Quarterly update

Kees Groenendijk and Carolus Grütters
Helen Oosterom-Staples

Jean Monnet Centre of Excellence

| Centre for Migration Law
| European and International Public Law

| Radboud University Nijmegen
| Tilburg University



New cases and new judgments (or conclusions) not mentioned in the previous overview are marked in red.

Judgments and pending cases are arranged in chronological order (oldest first).

Blue underscored references contain hyperlinks to the original documents.

Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union



1. Regular Migration

Family Reunification Directive 2003/86	Date	Case nr	ECLI:EU:C:	Subject
<i>judgments</i>				
Parliament/Council	27 Jun 2006	C-540/03	2006:429	right to family reunification
Chakroun	4 Mar 2010	C-578/08	2010:117	Art. 7(1)c income requirement
Imran (deleted)	10 Jun 2011	C-155/11 PPU	2011:387	Art. 7(2) integration test abroad
O., S. & L.	6 Dec 2012	C-356...357/11	2012:776	Art. 5(5) interest of the child; Art. 24(2) Charter
Dogan (Naime)	10 Jul 2014	C-138/13	2014:2066	Art. 7(2) integration test abroad
Noorzia	17 Jul 2014	C-338/13	2014:2092	Art. 4(5) minimum age of 21 years
K. & A.	9 Jul 2015	C-153/14	2015:523	Art. 7(2) integration test abroad
Khachab	21 Apr 2016	C-558/14	2016:285	Art. 7(1)c stable and regular resources
A. & S.	12 Apr 2018	C-550/16	2018:248	Art. 10 reunification of minor asylum seekers with parents
C. & A.	7 Nov 2018	C-257/17	2018:876	Art. 15 autonomous permit; integration condition
K. & B.	7 Nov 2018	C-380/17	2018:877	Art. 12(1); family reunification after 3 months
K.	7 Nov 2018	C-484/17	2018:878	Art. 15 autonomous permit; integration condition
E.	13 Mar 2019	C-635/17	2019:192	proof of family ties
Y.Z. a.o.	14 Mar 2019	C-557/17	2019:203	Art. 16(2)(a); consequences of fraude
X.	20 Nov 2019	C-706/18	2019:993	Art. 2(d)+5(4)+11(2) no automatic residence permit as a consequence of expiry of decision period
G.S. & V.G.	12 Dec 2019	C-381+382/18	2019:1072	Art. 6(2) public order
T.B.	12 Dec 2019	C-519/18	2019:1070	Art. 10(2) family member dependent on refugee
<i>pending cases</i>				
B.S.		C-133/19		Art. 4; becoming adult during procedure
B.M.M.		C-136/19		Art. 4; becoming adult during procedure
B.M.O.		C-137/19		Art. 4(1)(c); becoming adult during procedure
B.O.L.		C-250/19		Art. 4+18; becoming adult during procedure

Long-Term Residents

Directive 2003/109 and 2011/51

judgments	Date	Case nr	ECLI:EU:C:	Subject
Ziebell	8 Dec 2011	C-371/08	2011:809	Art. 12; expulsion = EEC-Turkey
Kamberaj	24 Apr 2012	C-571/10	2012:233	equal treatment; housing benefits
Com./NL	26 Apr 2012	C-508/10	2012:243	fees for residence permit
Singh	18 Oct 2012	C-502/10	2012:636	Art. 3(2)(e); formally restricted residence permit
Iida	8 Nov 2012	C-40/11	2012:691	lodging application for LTR is essential
Milalali	14 Nov 2013	C-257/13	2013:763	equal treatment; inadmissible
Tahir	17 Jul 2014	C-469/13	2014:2094	5 years residence also for spouse
Tümer	5 Nov 2014	C-311/13	2014:2337	LTR Dir not a contrario less rights for other TCN
P. & S.	4 Jun 2015	C-579/13	2015:369	integration obligation after acquisition status
CGIL	2 Sep 2015	C-309/14	2015:523	amount of fee for LTR permit
Lopez Pastuzano	7 Dec 2017	C-636/16	2017:949	Art.12; expulsion
Y.Z. a.o.	14 Mar 2019	C-557/17	2019:203	Art. 9(1)(a); implications of fraude
X.	3 Oct 2019	C-302/18	2019:830	Art. 5(1)(a) equal treatment family benefit
<i>pending cases</i>				
V.R.		C-303/19		Art. 11(1)(d) equal treatment family benefit
W.T. a.o.		C-448+531+533+ 534+549+567/19		Art. 12; criminal offence; withdrawal of status
U.Q. a.o.		C-503+592/19		Art. 4+6(1); refusal LTR status for criminal record

Researchers and Students					
Directive 2004/114 and 2016/801		Date	Case nr	ECLI:EU:C:	Subject
<i>judgments</i>					
Payir	24 Nov 2008	C-294/06	2008:36	working Turkish student	
Sommer	21 June 2012	C-15/11	2012:371	Art. 17; standstill Accession Bulgaria	
Ben Alaya	10 Sep 2014	C-491/13	2014:2187	non-discretionary right to a student visa	
Fahimian	4 Apr 2017	C-544/15	2017:255	Art. 6(1)(d); national security	
Single Permit					
Directive 2011/98					
<i>judgments</i>					
Martinez Silva	21 Jun 2017	C-449/16	2017:485	Art. 12(1)(e) equal treatment family benefit	
<i>pending cases</i>					
W.S.		C-302/19		Art. 12(1)(e) equal treatment family benefit	
Social Security for TCN					
Regulation 859/2003 and 1231/2010					
<i>judgments</i>					
Xhymshiti	18 Nov 2010	C-247/09	2010:698	child benefits; worker in Switzerland	
Wieland & Rothwangl	27 Oct 2016	C-465/14	2016:820	old-age pension	
Balandin	24 Jan 2019	C-477/17	2019:60	legal residence concept	
2. Asylum					
Dublin II and III		Date	Case nr	ECLI:EU:C	Subject
Regulation 343/2003 and 604/2013		Date	Case nr	ECLI:EU:C	Subject
<i>judgments</i>					
Petrosian	29 Jan 2009	C-19/08	2009:41	transfer deadline; suspensive effect	
N.S. & M.E.	21 Dec 2011	C-411+493/10	2011:865	conditions in Greece; no transfer	
Kastrati	3 May 2012	C-620/10	2012:265	withdrawal asylum application	
K.	6 Nov 2012	C-245/11	2012:685	Art. 15; sovereignty and humanitarian clause	
Halaf	30 May 2013	C-528/11	2013:342	Art. 18 Charter; sovereignty clause	
M.A. a.o.	2 Sep 2013	C-648/11	2013:367	transfer of unaccompanied minor	
Puid	14 Nov 2013	C-4/11	2013:740	responsible State in stead of Greece	
Abdullahi	12 Dec 2013	C-394/12	2013:813	Art. 19(2); meaning of First Member State	
Mirza	17 Mar 2016	C-695/15 PPU	2016:188	Art. 3(3); safe third country	
Ghezelbash	7 Jun 2016	C-63/15	2016:409	Right to appeal incorrect MS determination	
Karim	7 Jun 2016	C-155/15	2016:410	Art. 19(2); meaning of First Member State	
C.K. a.o.	16 Feb 2017	C-578/16 PPU	2017:127	transfer of mentally ill asylum seeker	
Al Chodor	15 Mar 2017	C-528/15	2017:213	Art. 28; risk of absconding	
Ahmed	5 Apr 2017	C-36/17	2017:273	Dublin not applicable if subs. protection is granted	
A.S.	26 Jul 2017	C-490/16	2017:585	Art. 13(1); Dublin III and 'irregular crossing'	
Jafari	26 Jul 2017	C-646/16	2017:586	Art. 12+13; transit visa	
Mengestebab	26 Jul 2017	C-670/16	2017:587	Art. 21(1)+22(7); review transfer decision	
Khir Amayry	13 Sep 2017	C-60/16	2017:675	Art. 27(3)+(4); suspensive effect; time limit of detention	
Majid Shiri	25 Oct 2017	C-201/16	2017:805	Art. 27(1)+29(1)+29(2)	
Aziz Hasan	25 Jan 2018	C-360/16	2018:35	Art. 23+24; unlawful return after transferral	
Adil Hassan	31 May 2018	C-647/16	2018:368	Art. 26(1); notification TCN of transfer request	
X.	5 Jul 2018	C-213/17	2018:538	Art. 23(3); responsible Member State	
Fathi	4 Oct 2018	C-56/17	2018:803	Art. 46(3); examination	
X. & X.	13 Nov 2018	C-47+48/17	2018:900	Art. 5(2) Reg. 1560/2003 on appl. of Dublin rules	
M.A.	23 Jan 2019	C-661/17	2019:53	Art. 6+17+20(3); does Brexit affect current transfer decisions	
Jawo	19 Mar 2019	C-163/17	2019:218	Art. 29(2); risk of absconding	
H. & R.	2 Apr 2019	C-582+583/17	2019:280	Art. 20(5)+27; right to appeal	
<i>pending cases</i>					
H.A.		C-194/19		Art. 27; effective remedy	
Qualification I and II					
Directive 2004/83 and 2011/95					
<i>judgments</i>					
Elgafaji	17 Feb 2009	C-465/07	2009:94	Art. 15c; serious harm	
Abdulla a.o.	2 March 2010	C-175...179/08	2010:105	revocation; new circumstances	
Bolbol	17 June 2010	C-31/09	2010:351	Palestinian exception	
B. & D.	9 Nov 2010	C-57/09	2010:661	terrorist acts organisation	
Y. & Z.	5 Sep 2012	C-71/11	2012:558	Ahmadiyya in Pakistan	
M.M.	22 Nov 2012	C-277/11	2012:744	duty of cooperation	
El Kott	19 Dec 2012	C-364/11	2012:826	Palestinian exception	
X., Y. & Z.	7 Nove 2013	C-199...201/12	2013:720	homosexual orientation forms a social group	
Diakite	30 Jan 2014	C-285/12	2014:39	internal armed conflict	
H.N.	8 May 2014	C-604/12	2014:302	connectivity subs. protection and refugee status	
Qurbani	17 Jul 2014	C-481/13	2014:2101	no interpr. Refugee Convention by CJEU	
A., B. & C.	2 Dec 2014	C-148...150/13	2014:2406	homosexual orientation	
M'Bodj	18 Dec 2014	C-542/13	2014:2452	right to medical treatment	

(Qualification continued)

Abdida	18 Dec 2014	C-562/13	2014:2453	QD does not cover admission on medical grounds
Shepherd	26 Feb 2015	C-472/13	2015:117	conscientious war objector
T.	24 Jun 2015	C-373/13	2015:413	Art. 24(1) or 21(3); withdrawal of refugee status
Alo & Osso	1 Mar 2016	C-443...444/14	2016:127	Art. 33+29; restriction of residence; subs. protection
M.	9 Feb 2017	C-560/14	2016:320	right to be heard
Lounani	31 Jan 2017	C-573/14	2016:380	Art. 12; exclusion clause and terrorist
F.	25 Jan 2018	C-473/16	2018:36	homosexuality test in Hungary
M.P.	24 Apr 2018	C-353/16	2018:276	previous torture and subs. protection
Alheto	25 Jul 2018	C-585/16	2018:584	Palestinian exception
Shajin Ahmed	13 Sep 2018	C-369/17	2018:713	Art. 17(1)(b); exclusion ground
Ahmedbekova	4 Oct 2018	C-652/16	2018:801	application family member
Fathi	4 Oct 2018	C-56/17	2018:803	persecution on religious grounds
Ayubi	21 Nov 2018	C-713/17	2018:929	Art. 29; social assistance
M. a.o.	14 May 2019	C-391/16 + C-77...78/17	2019:403	Art. 14; Art. 18 Charter; revoke refugee status; Art. 78(1) TFEU
Bilali	23 May 2019	C-720/17	2019:448	Art. 19(1)+(3) withdrawal of subsidiary protection

pending cases

E.Z.	C-238/19	Art. 9(2); refusal of military service
O.A.	C-255/19	Art. 2(e)+7+11; protection of the country of nationality
X.T.	C-507/19	Art. 12(1)(a) Palestinian
M.S. a.o.	C-616/19	Art. 25 QD I and subsidiary protection
S.E.	C-768/19	Art. 2(j)+11 QD II; family member;

Asylum Procedures I and II

Directive 2005/85 and 2013/32

judgments

Parliament/Council	6 May 2008	C-133/06	2008:257	list of safe countries of origin
Diouf	28 July 2011	C-69/10	2011:524	accelerated procedure; remedies
H.I.D. & B.A.	31 Jan 2013	C-175/11	2013:45	accelerated procedure; remedies
Tall	17 Dec 2015	C-239/14	2015:824	effective remedy and multiple asylum claim
Danqua	20 Oct 2016	C-429/15	2016:789	dealing with application within reasonable time
Sacko	26 Jul 2017	C-348/16	2017:591	effective remedy
Magamadov	19 Sep 2017	C-438/17	2017:723	Art. 52 transitional provision and subs. protection
C. & J.	5 Jul 2018	C-269/18 PPU	2018:544	Art. 46(8); suspensory effect
A.	25 Jul 2018	C-404/17	2018:588	country of origin info and clearly unfoundedness
Alheto	25 Jul 2018	C-585/16	2018:584	Palestinian exception
X.	26 Sep 2018	C-175/17	2018:776	suspensory effect of appeal only at first instance
X. & Y.	26 Sep 2018	C-180/17	2018:775	suspensory effect of appeal only at first instance
Ahmedbekova	4 Oct 2018	C-652/16	2018:801	Art. 33(2)(e); direct effect; application family member
Fathi	4 Oct 2018	C-56/17	2018:803	Art. 3(1); meaning of examination
E.G.	18 Oct 2018	C-662/17	2018:847	Art. 46(2) subsidiary protection
D. & I. (deleted)	15 Nov 2018	C-586/17	2018:964	introduction new asylum motive in appeal
F.R.	27 Sep 2018	C-422/18 PPU	2018:784	suspensory effect of appeal
Ibrahim Bashar	19 Mar 2019	C-297/17	2019:219	Art. 52 transitional provision and subs. protection
Torubarov	29 Jul 2019	C-556/17	2019:626	Art. 46(3) power to amend decisions of competent authority
Hamed & Omar	13 Nov 2019	C-540+541/17	2019:964	inadequate conditions for refugees

pending cases

Addis		C-517/17	admissibility of appl. in 2nd MS on the ground of no access to granted rights in 1st MS
P.G.	AG: 5 Dec 2019	C-406/18	Art. 31; effective judicial remedy; Art. 47 Charter
L.H.	AG: 5 Dec 2019	C-564/18	Art. 33 inadmissible applications
Com./Hungary		C-808/18	incorrect application of CEAS measures
E.Y.		C-40/19	Art. 31 overruling or annulment of an aslym decision
K.D.		C-67/19	Art. 31 overruling or annulment of an aslym decision
T.N.		C-210/19	Art. 31 overruling or annulment of an aslym decision
M.S., a.o.		C-616/19	Art. 25(2); MS concerned; further application
J.P.		C-651/19	Art. 46; effective remedy; short term

Reception Conditions I and II

Directive 2003/9 and 2013/33

judgments

CIMADE & GISTI	27 Sep 2012	C-179/11	2012:594	reception conditions during Dublin procedure
Saciri	27 Feb 2014	C-79/13	2014:103	saturation of national reception structures
J.N.	15 Feb 2016	C-601/15 PPU	2016:84	Art. 8; detention and Art 6 Charter
K.	14 Sep 2017	C-18/16	2017:680	Art. 8(3) in relation with Art 6 Charter
D.H. (deleted)	8 Mar 2019	C-704/17	2019:247	Art. 9; judicial review after detention has ended
Haqbin	12 Nov 2019	C-233/18	2019:956	Art. 20; unaccompanied minor, serious breach of rules reception centre

pending cases

F.W. & G.Y.		C-726/18	Art. 20; breach of rules reception centre
K.S. & M.H.K.		C-322/19	Art. 15; reception and delay of Dublin transfer
R.A.T. & D.S.		C-385/19	Art. 15; categories of 'applicant'

Provisional measures of protection for the benefit of Italy and Greece
Council Decision 2015/1523 and 2015/1601

judgments

Slovakia & Hungary/Council 6 Sep 2017 [C-643+647/15](#) 2017:631 relocation decision is legally correct

pending cases

Com./Poland, Hungary and Czech Republic AG: 31 Oct 2019 [C-715+718+719/17](#) 2019:917 failing to fulfil obligations

3. Borders and Visa

Schengen Acquis

Convention of 14 June 1985

Date

Case nr

ECLI:EU:C:

Subject

judgments

E. 16 Jan 2018 [C-240/17](#) 2018:8 Art. 25 entry ban

pending cases

A. [C-193/19](#) Art. 6 establishment of identity

Borders Code

Regulation 562/2006 and 2016/399

judgments

Garcia & Cabrera	22 Oct 2009	C-261+348/08	2009:648	Art. 11; no obligation to expel
Melki & Abdeli	22 June 2010	C-188+189/10	2010:206	Art. 21; internal border
Gaydarov	17 Nov 2011	C-430/10	2011:749	Art. 27; criminal conviction in other MS
ANAFE	14 June 2012	C-606/10	2012:348	Art. 5(4)+13; return visa
Adil	19 July 2012	C-278/12 PPU	2012:508	Art. 21; internal border
Parliament/Council	5 Sep 2012	C-355/10	2012:516	annulment implementing measure
Zakaria	17 Jan 2013	C-23/12	2013:24	appeal against refusal at the border
Air Baltic	4 Sep 2014	C-575/12	2014:2155	limited grounds for refusal at border
A	21 Jun 2016	C-9/16	2017:483	Art. 23; internal border and control
El Dakkak	4 May 2017	C-17/16	2017:341	Art. 4(1); internal border
Touring Tours a.o.	13 Dec 2018	C-412+474/17	2018:1005	Art. 22+23; obligation to check documents
Arib	19 Mar. 2019	C-444/17	2019:220	Art. 32; penal sanctions on illegal entry after reintroduced border controls
E.P.	12 Dec 2019	C-380/18	2019:1071	Art. 6(1)(e); public order

pending cases

J. a.o.	AG: 17 Oct 2019	C-341/18	2019:882	Art. 11; departure stamps border crossing
Blue Air/D.Z.	AG: 21 Nov 2019	C-584/18	2019:1003	Art. 14(2) exemption visa obligation

Border Traffic

Regulation 1931/2006

judgments

Shomodi 21 Mar 2013 [C-254/11](#) 2013:182 3-month period local border traffic

Border Surveillance System

Regulation 1052/2013

judgments

Spain v. EP & Council 8 Sep 2015 [C-44/14](#) 2015:554 Art. 19; cooperation Eurosur with UK/IR

Passports

Regulation 2252/2004

judgments

Schwarz	17 Oct 2014	C-291/12	2013:670	use of finger prints for other purposes
Com./Belgium	13 Feb 2014	C-139/13	2014:80	failure to issue biometric passports
U.	2 Oct. 2014	C-101/13	2014:2249	first name, surname and birth name in passport
Willems a.o.	16 Apr 2015	C-446...449/12	2015:238	no right to passport without biometric data

Transit through Switzerland

Decision 896/2006

judgments

Kqiku 2 Apr 2009 [C-139/08](#) 2009:230 TCN with Swiss residence permit

Visa Code

Regulation 810/2009

judgments

Vo	10 Apr 2012	C-83/12	2012:202	Art. 21+34; human trafficking
Koushkaki	19 Dec 2013	C-84/12	2013:862	limited ground refusal visa; discretion MS
Air Baltic	4 Sep 2014	C-575/12	2014:2155	valid visa in cancelled travel document
X & X	7 Mar 2017	C-638/16 PPU	2017:173	Art. 25(1)(a); humanitarian visa
El Hassani	13 Dec 2017	C-403/16	2017:960	Art. 32; effective remedy
Vethanayagam	29 Jul 2019	C-680/17	2019:627	Art. 8(4)+32(3) Visa representation; Art 47 Charter

pending cases

R.N.N.S.		C-225+226/19		Art. 32; effective remedy against refusal
-----------------	--	------------------------------	--	---

Visa List				
Regulation 539/2001				
judgments				
Com./Parliament	16 Jul 2015	C-88/14	2015:499	validity of amendments
4. Irregular Migration				
Facilitation				
Directive 2002/90	Date	Subject	ECLI:EU:C:	Subject
Judgments				
Paoletti a.o. Vo	25 May 2016 10 April 2002	C-218/15 C-83/12 PPU	2016:748 2012:12	retroactivity of the more lenient criminal law human smuggling
Return				
Directive 2008/115				
judgments				
Kadzoev El Dridi Achughbabian Sagor Mbaye Arslan G. & R. Filev & Osmani Mahdi Bero & Bouzalmate Pham Mukarubega Boudjlida Abdida Zaizoune Zh. & O. Celaj Bensada Benalla Affum Ouhrami Petrea E. K.A. a.o. Gnandi X. X. & Y. Arib	30 Nov 2009 28 Apr 2011 6 Dec 2011 6 Dec 2012 21 Mar 2013 30 May 2013 10 Sep 2013 19 Sep 2013 5 Jun 2014 17 Jul 2014 17 Jul 2014 5 Nov. 2014 11 Dec 2014 18 Dec 2014 23 Apr 2015 11 June 2015 1 Oct 2015 17 Mar 2016 7 Jun 2016 26 Jul 2017 14 Sep 2017 16 Jan 2018 8 May 2018 19 Jun 2017 26 Sep 2018 26 Sep 2018 19 Mar 2019	C-357/09 PPU C-61/11 PPU C-329/11 C-430/11 C-522/11 C-534/11 C-383/13 PPU C-297/12 C-146/14 PPU C-473+514/13 C-474/13 C-166/13 C-249/13 C-562/13 C-38/14 C-554/13 C-290/14 C-161/15 C-47/15 C-225/16 C-184/16 C-240/17 C-82/16 C-181/16 C-175/17 C-180/17 C-444/17	2009:741 2011:268 2011:807 2012:277 2013:190 2013:343 2013:533 2013:569 2014:1320 2014:2095 2014:2096 2014:2336 2014:2431 2014:2453 2015:260 2015:377 2015:640 2016:175 2016:408 2017:590 2017:684 2018:8 2018:308 2018:465 2018:776 2018:775 2019:220	maximum period of detention prison sentence; order to return sanctions non-compliance return order fine, home detention, expulsion prevails fine, deportation, risk of absconding directive and detention asylum seekers infringement rights of defence old unlimited entry bans incompatible scope judicial review; coop. with removal absence from special detention centre separation of ordinary criminals right to be heard right to be heard suspensive effect of appeal on medical grounds fine is incompatible with removal risk to public policy prison sanction, entry ban and removal right to be heard transit passenger and illegal stay start of entry ban entry ban and citizen of the Union Art. 6(2); entry ban suspension of entry ban and family life suspensive effect and effective remedy suspensory effect of appeal limited to first instance suspensory effect of appeal limited to first instance penal sanctions on illegal entry after reintroduced border controls
pending cases				
J.Z. Com./Hungary W.M. B. L.M. T.Q. Westerwaldkreis M.O. M.		C-806/18 C-808/18 C-18/19 C-233/19 C-402/19 C-441/19 C-546/19 C-568/19 C-673/19		Art. 11(2) entry ban Art. 5+6+12+13; procedural guarantees Art. 16; deportation Art. 5+13; deportation and health risks Art. 5+13; deportation and health risks Art. 6+8+10; enforcement of return decision and unaccompanied minors Art. 2(2)(b)+3(6) entry ban Incompatibility Spanish legislation Art. 3+4+6+15 removal of TCN with international protection in another MS
Mutual recognition expulsion decisions				
Directive 2001/40				
judgments				
Orrego Arias	3 Sep 2015	C-456/14	2015:550	CJEU lacks jurisdiction
pending cases				
W.T.		C-448/19		expulsion of TCN
5. EEC-Turkey Association Agreement				
Workers and Family Members				
Decision 2/76 and 1/80	Date	Case nr	ECLI:EU:C:	Subject
judgments				
Demirel Sevinc Kus Erogul Bozkurt (Ahmet)	30 Sept 1987 20 Sept 1990 16 Dec 1992 5 Oct 1994 6 June 1995	C-12/86 C-192/89 C-237/91 C-355/93 C-434/93	1987:400 1990:322 1992:527 1994:369 1995:168	Art. 12 AO + 36 AP: no right to family reunion Art. 6; direct effect; stable position labour market Art. 6; stable position labour market Art. 6; same employer/no loss; also qualifies under 7(2) Art. 6; belonging to labour market

(Workers and Family Members continued)

Tetik	23 Jan 1997	C-171/95	1997:31	Art. 6; voluntary unemployment after 4 years
Kadiman	17 Apr 1997	C-351/95	1997:205	Art. 7(1); calculation period cohabitation as family
Eker	29 May 1997	C-386/95	1997:257	Art. 6; same employer
Kol	5 June 1997	C-285/95	1997:280	Art. 6; conviction for fraud
Ertanir	30 Sept 1997	C-98/96	1997:446	Art. 6; analogous application Art. 45 TFEU
Günaydin	30 Sept 1997	C-36/96	1997:445	Art. 6; analogous application Art. 45 TFEU
Akman	19 Nov 1998	C-210/97	1998:555	Art. 7(2); Turkish worker has left labour market
Birden	26 Nov 1998	C-1/97	1998:568	Art. 6; sheltered work not marginal & ancillary
Nazli	10 Feb 2000	C-340/97	2000:77	Art. 6/14; no loss residence right during detention; analogous application Art. 27(2) Dir 2004/38
Ergat	16 Mar 2000	C-329/97	2000:133	Art. 7(1); no loss residence right application for renewal residence permit after expiry date
Eyüp	22 June 2000	C-65/98	2000:336	Art. 7(1); obligation to co-habit as family
Bicakci	19 Sept 2000	C-89/00	-	Art. 14; no preventive expulsion measure
Kurz (Yuce)	19 Nov 2002	C-188/00	2002:694	Art. 6; rights following unjustified expulsion measure
Birlikte	8 May 2003	C-171/01	2003:260	Art. 10; direct effect/analogous interpretation Art. 45(2) TFEU; political trade union rights
Abatay & Sahin Com./Austria	21 Oct 2003	C-317/01+369/01	2003:572	Art. 13; direct effect/scope standstill obligation
	16 Sept 2004	C-465/01	2004:530	Art. 10; direct effect/analogous interpretation Art. 45(2) TFEU; political trade union rights
Ayaz	30 Sept 2004	C-275/02	2004:570	Art. 7(1); stepchild is family member
Cetinkaya	11 Nov 2004	C-467/02	2004:708	Art. 7(1); family member analogous Art. 10 Reg 1612/68
Dörr & Ünal	2 June 2005	C-136/03	2005:340	Art. 14; procedural guarantees Dir 64/221
Aydinli	7 July 2005	C-373/03	2005:434	Art. 7(1); long detention no justification loss
Dogan (Ergül)	7 July 2005	C-383/03	2005:436	Art. 6; return labour market: no loss due to detention
Gürol	7 July 2005	C-374/03	2005:435	Art. 9; right to education grant for study in Turkey
Sedef	10 Jan 2006	C-230/03	2006:5	Art. 6; same employer/maritime shipping
Torun	16 Feb 2006	C-502/04	2006:112	Art. 7(2); 2 reasons for loss residence right
Güzel	26 Oct 2006	C-4/05	2006:670	Art. 6(2); rights only after one year with same employer
Derin	18 July 2007	C-325/05	2007:442	Art. 7; 2 reasons for loss rights/prison sentence
Polat	4 Oct 2007	C-349/06	2007:581	Art. 14; multiple convictions small crimes no expulsion
Payir a.o.	24 Jan 2008	C-294/06	2008:36	Art. 6; reason admission not relevant (study/au pair)
Nihat Kahveci	25 July 2008	C-152/08	2008:450	Art. 10(1); Turkish prof. football player counts as national player
Er	25 Sept 2008	C-453/07	2008:524	Art. 7(1); no loss right no paid employment
Altun	18 Dec 2008	C-337/07	2008:744	Art. 7(1); rights family members of unemployed Turkish worker or fraud by Turkish worker
Sahin	17 Sept 2009	C-242/06	2009:554	Art. 13; fees for residence permit
Bekleyen	21 Jan 2010	C-462/08	2010:30	Art. 7(2); start training/parents not in host-MS
Genc (Hava) Com./Netherlands	4 Feb 2010	C-14/09	2010:57	Art. 6; part-time worker/real & genuine employment
Toprak & Oguz	29 Apr 2010	C-92/07	2010:228	Art. 13; fees for residence permit
Bozkurt (Metin)	2 Dec 2010	C-300...301/09	2010:756	Art. 13; no going back on relaxation national rules
Pehlivan	22 Dec 2010	C-303/08	2010:800	Art. 7(1); divorce doesn't affect right
Baris Ünal	16 June 2011	C-484/07	2011:395	Art. 7(1); no retroactive withdrawal residence permit
Ziebell	29 Sept 2011	C-187/10	2011:623	Art. 6; no retroactive withdrawal residence permit
Kahveci & Inan	8 Dec 2011	C-371/08	2011:809	Art. 14; no analogous appl. Art. 28(3)(a) Dir 2004/38
Dülger	29 Mar 2012	C-7...9/10	2012:180	Art. 7(1); worker dual nationality (Turkish & host-MS)
Gülbahce	19 July 2012	C-451/11	2012:504	Art. 7(1); nationality family member irrelevant
Demir	8 Nov 2012	C-268/11	2012:695	Art. 6; no retroactive withdrawal residence permit
Essent	7 Nov 2013	C-225/12	2013:725	Art. 13; legal residence; objective justification
Genc (Cancer)	11 Sep 2014	C-91/13	2014:2206	Art. 13; not applicable if Turkish worker does not seek access to labour market of MS
Ucar a.o.	12 Apr 2016	C-561/14	2016:247	Art. 13; applies to family reunion rules; ties with DK; integration
Tekdemir	21 Dec 2016	C-508...509/15	2016:986	Art. 7; family life, lawful employment
Yön	29 Mar 2017	C-652/15	2017:239	Art. 13; family reunification
A.	7 Aug 2018	C-123/17	2018:632	Art. 13; Art. 7 Dec. 2/76; language test; objective justification
A., B. & P.	10 Jul 2019	C-89/18	2019:580	Art. 13; requirement of closer ties with Denmark
	3 Oct 2019	C-70/18	2019:823	Art. 7 Dec. 2/76; Art. 13 Dec. 1/80; standstill clauses and Overriding reasons of public interest

pending cases

G.R.	C-720/19	Art. 7(1) Dec. 1/80; loss of nationality
------	----------	--

Establishment and Provision of Services

Additional Protocol

Subject: ref to AP unless stated otherwise

judgments

Savas	11 May 2000	C-37/98	2000:224	Art. 13 AO & 41: direct effect/scope standstill
Abatay & Sahin	21 Oct 2003	C-317/01	2003:572	scope standstill obligation
Yedas Tarim/Council	5 July 2007	C-255/06 P	2007:414	significance of requirements mentioned in preamble only
Tum & Dari	20 Sept 2007	C-16/05	2007:530	scope standstill obligation
Soysal & Savatlı Com./Netherlands	19 Feb 2009	C-228/06	2009:101	standstill also applies to EU secondary law
Tural Oguz	29 Apr 2010	C-92/07	2010:228	fees residence permits covered by standstill
	21 July 2011	C-186/10	2011:509	definition fraud covered by standstill

(Establishment and Provision of Services continued)

Dereci a.o.	15 Nov 2011	C-256/11	2011:734	fraud
Demirkhan	24 Sep 2013	C-221/11	2013:583	recipients of services not covered by Art. 41(1)
Dogan (Naime)	10 Jul 2014	C-138/13	2014:2066	language requirement abroad; objective justification
Essent	11 Sep 2014	C-91/13	2014:2206	Art. 41 requires economic activity between T. and EU

Social Security Decision 3/80				Subject: ref to Dec 3/80 unless stated otherwise
<i>judgments</i>				
Taflan-Met a.o.	10 Sept 1996	C-277/94	1996:315	Dec 3/80 has entered into force
Sürül	4 May 1999	C-262/96	1999:228	Art. 3; direct effect
Kocak & Örs	14 Mar 2000	C-102/98	2000:119	determination of date of birth
Öztürk	28 Apr 2004	C-373/02	2004:232	conditions early old-age pension
Akdas	26 May 2011	C-485/07	2011:346	Art. 6; direct effect
Demirci a.o.	14 Jan. 2015	C-171/13	2018:8	Art. 6; dual nationality
Çoban	15 May 2019	C-677/17	2019:408	Art. 6; return and LTR-status
<i>pending cases</i>				
Güler & Solak		C-257+258/18		Art. 6; effect of loss of Union citizenship

6. Free Movement

EU citizens and Family members Directive 2004/38 and Articles 20-21 TFEU Regulation 492/2011			Subject, Art.		Dir 2004/38	Reg 492/2011
	Date	Case nr	ECLI:EU:C:	TFEU		
<i>judgments</i>						
Jipa	10 Jul 2008	C-33/07	2008:396	20	4+27	-
Metock	25 Jul 2008	C-127/08	2008:449	-	3(1)	-
Föster	18 Nov 2008	C-158/07	2008:630	18+20	-	-
Huber	16 Dec 2008	C-524/06	2008:724	18	-	-
Deniz Sahin	19 Dec 2008	C-551/07	2008:755	-	3+6+7	-
Vatsouras & Koupatantze	4 Jun 2009	C-22...23/08	2009:344	18	24(2)	-
Wolzenburg	6 Oct 2009	C-123/08	2009:616	18	-	-
Ibrahim	23 Feb 2010	C-310/08	2010:80	-	-	10
Teixeira	23 Feb 2010	C-480/08	2010:83	-	-	10
Rottmann	2 Mar 2010	C-135/08	2010:104	20	-	-
Lassal	7 Oct 2010	C-162/09	2010:592	-	16	-
Tsakouridis	23 Nov 2010	C-145/09	2010:708	-	28(3)	-
Ruiz Zambrano	8 Mar 2011	C-34/09	2011:124	20	-	-
Runevič-Vardyn	12 May 2011	C-391/09	2011:291	21	-	-
McCarthy	5 May 2011	C-434/09	2011:277	21	-	-
Dias	21 Jul 2011	C-325/09	2011:498	-	16	-
Dereci	15 Nov 2011	C-256/11	2011:734	20	-	-
Gaydarov	17 Nov 2011	C-430/10	2011:749	-	4+27	-
Aladzhov	17 Nov 2011	C-434/10	2011:750	-	4+27	-
Ziolkowski & Szeja	21 Dec 2011	C-424...425/10	2011:866	-	16	-
P.I.	22 May 2012	C-384/09	2012:300	-	28(3)	-
Com./NL	14 Jun 2012	C-542/09	2012:346	45	-	7(2)
Rahman a.o.	5 Sep 2012	C-83/11	2012:519	-	3(2)	-
Czop & Punakova	6 Sep 2012	C-147...148/11	2012:538	-	16	10
Com./Austria	4 Oct 2012	C-75/11	2012:605	20+21	24	-
Byankov	4 Oct 2012	C-249/11	2012:608	-	27	-
Iida	8 Nov 2012	C-40/11	2012:691	20	-	-
O., S. & L.	6 Dec 2012	C-356...357/11	2012:776	20	3(1)	-
L.N.	21 Feb 2013	C-46/12	2013:97	45(2)	7(2)+24	-
Alarape & Tijani	8 May 2013	C-529/11	2013:290	-	-	10
Ymeraga	8 May 2013	C-87/12	2013:291	20	3(1)	-
Z.Z.	4 Jun 2013	C-300/11	2013:363	-	30(2)+31	-
Hadj Ahmed	13 Jun 2013	C-45/12	2013:390	18	13(2)+14	10
Prinz & Seeberger	18 Jun 2013	C-523+585/11	2013:524	20+21	-	-
Brey	19 Sep 2013	C-140/12	2013:565	-	7(1)(b)	-
Alokpa & Moudoulou	10 Oct 2013	C-86/12	2013:645	20	-	-
Onuekwere	16 Jan 2014	C-378/12	2014:13	-	16	-
M.G.	16 Jan 2014	C-400/12	2014:9	-	28(3)(a)	-
Reyes	16 Jan 2014	C-423/12	2014:16	-	2(2)(c)	-
O. & B.	12 Mar 2014	C-456/12	2014:135	20+21	3+6+7	-
S. & G.	12 Mar 2014	C-457/12	2014:136	20+21	3+6+7	-
Rüffer	27 Mar 2014	C-322/13	2014:189	18+21	-	-
Saint Prix	19 Jun 2014	C-507/12	2014:2007	45	7(3)	-
Ogierakhi	10 Jul 2014	C-244/13	2014:2068	-	16(2)	-
Haralambidis	10 Sep 2014	C-270/13	2014:2185	45(1)+(4)	-	-
Dano a.o.	11 Nov 2014	C-333/13	2014:2358	-	7(1)(b)+24(1)	4
Sean McCarthy a.o.	18 Dec 2014	C-202/13	2014:2450	-	10+35	-
Com./Belgium	5 Feb 2015	C-317/14	2015:63	45	-	-
Martens	26 Feb 2015	C-359/13	2015:118	20+21	-	-
Kuldeep Singh a.o.	26 Jul 2015	C-218/14	2015:476	-	7(1)(b)+13(2)(a)	-

(EU citizens and family members continued)				TFEU	2004/38	492/2011
Alimanovic	15 Sep 2015	C-67/14	2015:597	18+45	24(2)	4
Delvigne	6 Oct 2015	C-650/13	2015:648	20(2)(b)	-	-
Garcia-Nieto	25 Feb 2016	C-299/14	2015:366	-	24(2)	-
Bensada Benallal	17 Mar 2016	C-161/15	2016:175	-	28+30+31	-
Com./UK	14 Jun 2016	C-308/14	2016:436	-	7+14(2)+24(2)	-
N.A.	30 Jun 2016	C-115/15	2016:487	20+21	13(2)	10
Petruhhin	6 Sep 2016	C-182/15	2016:630	18+21	-	-
Rendón Marín	13 Sep 2016	C-165/14	2016:675	20+21	-	-
C.S.	13 Sep 2016	C-304/14	2016:674	20	-	-
Bragança	14 Dec 2016	C-238/15	2016:949	-	-	7(2)
Depesme & Kerrou	15 Dec 2016	C-401...403/15	2016:955	45	-	7(2)
Aquino	15 Mar 2017	C-3/16	2017:209	267	28	-
Chavez-Vilchez	10 May 2017	C-133/15	2017:354	20	-	-
Freitag	8 Jun 2017	C-541/15	2017:432	18+21	-	-
Bechtel	22 Jun 2017	C-20/16	2017:488	45	-	-
E.	13 Jul 2017	C-193/16	2017:542	-	27	-
Petrea	14 Sep 2017	C-184/16	2017:684	-	27-32	-
Lounes	14 Nov 2017	C-165/16	2017:862	21	3(1)+7+16	-
Gusa	20 Dec 2017	C-442/16	2017:1004	-	7(1)+7(3)+14(4)	-
B. & Vomero	17 Apr 2018	C-316+424/16	2018:256	-	28(3)(a)	-
K. & H.F.	2 May 2018	C-331+366/16	2018:296	-	27(2)+28(3)	-
K.A. a.o.	8 May 2018	C-82/16	2018:308	20	27+28	-
Coman a.o.	5 Jun 2018	C-673/16	2018:385	-	2(2)(a)+3	-
Deha Altiner & Ravn	27 Jun 2018	C-230/17	2018:497	21(1)	-	-
Diallo	27 Jun 2018	C-246/17	2018:499	-	10(1)	-
Banger	12 Jul 2018	C-89/17	2018:570	21	3(2)+15(1)	-
Rafal Prefeta	13 Sep 2018	C-618/16	2018:719	-	7(2)	-
Mahmood a.o. (deleted)	10 Jan 2019	C-169/18	2019:5	-	5(2)	-
Tjebbes a.o.	12 Mar 2019	C-221/17	2019:189	20+21	-	-
S.M.	26 Mar 2019	C-129/18	2019:248	-	2(2)+3(2)(a)	-
Tarola	11 Apr 2019	C-483/17	2019:309	-	7(1)(a)+7(3)(c)	-
Chenchooliah	10 Sep 2019	C-94/18	2019:693	-	7+15+30+31	-
Dakneviciute	19 Sep 2019	C-544/18	2019:761	49	7+16(3)	-
Bajratari	2 Oct 2019	C-93/18	2019:809	-	7(1)(b)	-
Krah	10 Oct 2019	C-703/17	2019:850	45	-	7(1)

pending cases

Ryan Air	C-754/18	-	5+10
R.H.	AG: 21 Nov 2019	C-836/18	20
A.T.		C-32/19	17(1)(a)
J.D.		C-181/19	24(2)
Z.W.		C-454/19	(in full)
A.		C-535/19	7(1)(b)+24
G.M.A.		C-710/19	15+31
Bar Association		C-718/19	(in full)

Sources: <<https://www.curia.europa.eu>> | <<https://www.migratieweb.nl>>
 <<https://cmr.jur.ru.nl/nemis>> | <<https://cmr.jur.ru.nl/neais>> | <<https://cmr.jur.ru.nl/nefis>> |
 Want to sign up? <mailto:c.grutters@jur.ru.nl>